Practical Approaches for Using Literature in Nursing Education in the US and UK

Emiko Ubukawa
Gunma Prefectural College of Health Sciences

Objective: The purpose of this study was to obtain useful suggestions regarding the use of literature in the EFL (English as a Foreign Language) classroom for Japanese trainee nursing students as well as for other healthcare professionals.

Methods: A retrospective analysis was performed on how literary works were used in nursing education in the U.S. and U.K. Twenty-two research papers and practical reports based on the use of literary works and their effectiveness in nursing education presented in American and British nursing articles were categorized and analyzed. The articles were retrieved from a previous online electronic search of the Cumulative Index to Nursing & Allied Health Literature (CINAHL).

Results: Literature-based teaching approaches were categorized into four groups: 1) a discussion approach; 2) a writing approach; 3) a discussion and writing approach; and 4) other approaches. The discussion approach was first introduced in 1968, whereas the writing approach gradually came into wider use in the late 1990s. In the 1980s, other teaching approaches, including the combination of other arts and various kinds of teaching approaches, were also introduced. These approaches were based on discussion and/or writing, although the plain discussion approach began to lose significance in the 2000s.

Conclusions: The present analysis of the use of literature in nursing education practiced in the U.S. and U.K. provides important suggestions on how to use literature in the EFL classroom for trainee healthcare professionals. However, further research will be necessary to seek out even better teaching methods targeting these professionals in the EFL classroom.

Key words: nursing education, literature-based education, teaching approach, EFL

1. Introduction

Both the American and British articles on the use of literature in nursing education provided a rough but promising overview of using literature in nursing education. For my previous study, I used similar articles, which were basically obtained from the Cumulative Index to Nursing & Allied Health Literature (CINAHL). The previous study addressed two very important points in this regard: 1) the type of literary works which could be utilized, and 2) certain traits essential for nursing services such as empathy, sensitivity, insight, and so on which could be enriched by nursing educators or researchers in literature-based nursing education

The aim of this present study was to categorize and present a retrospective analysis of how literary works were utilized by nursing...
educators or researchers to educate nurses in both the U.S. and U.K. in the period from 1968 through 2010. The result of this analysis would be a significant indicator of how literary works in the EFL classroom could help students grow mentally as well as improve their general English language skills.

II. Methods

In the previous study, articles on the use of literature or literary works in nursing education (n=329) were collected from the web version of CINAHL by using the key words ‘literature,’ ‘nursing,’ and ‘education.’ However, terms such as ‘nursing literature,’ ‘the review of literature,’ and ‘literature review’ from the key words had to be eliminated because of the ‘other’ meaning of literature. After closer scrutiny of such related articles, it was found that there were also some articles on literature-based education without any of the key words ‘literature,’ ‘education,’ and ‘nursing,’ and that 30 out of 329 articles were related to literature-based nursing education. In order to collect as many articles on literature-based education as possible, the seemingly related ones were extracted from the references of each paper. Eventually the number of the related articles amounted 41.

Among the 41 articles, 22 articles included research papers and practical reports indicating how to use literary works and their effectiveness in nursing education. In this paper, ‘literary works’ includes novels, short stories, and poems written not only by professional writers, but also by non-professionals such as nurses. These collected research papers and practical reports were categorized and analyzed in terms of teaching approach.

III. Results

Teaching approaches based on selected literary works utilized in nursing classes from 1968 through 2010 were sorted into mainly four groups: 1) a discussion approach, 2) a writing approach, 3) a discussion and writing approach, and 4) other approaches. In the discussion approach, students were asked to discuss or share their own opinions about the chosen literary works. The writing approach encouraged students to write their own statements or complete a paper on a selected piece of literature, while an integrated approach of discussion and writing requires the student either to discuss after writing about the target literary work, or write their own opinions about it after discussion. Other approaches included various approaches based on discussion and/or writing, and approaches integrated into other arts such as music, fine arts, and film.

Figure 1 presents the frequency of use of each teaching approach based on literature, introduced into nursing education in both the U.S. and U.K.
Among the 22 articles, six articles (27%) were related to the discussion approach, five articles (23%) to the writing approach, two articles (9%) about the discussion and writing approach, and the remaining nine articles (41%) were about other approaches. The previous researches on different teaching approaches, grouped into four categories, are represented in tabulated form below (Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Content of Teaching Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>Williams, C., George, J.</td>
<td>A group of senior nursing students was formed on a voluntary basis and they participated in discussion meetings which were held five times. The number of participants varied from six to sixteen depending on the target novel. They were required to select and discuss current literature with psychiatric implications in order to be familiar with a small portion of the media pertaining to psychiatry.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treisman, J.M.</td>
<td>A class of senior level baccalaureate students were divided into small groups of three or four, and asked to discuss feminist poetry.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>Darbyshire, P.</td>
<td>Thirteen students took part in two focus group discussions after reading two novels. They were requested to discuss numerous aspects of their experiences of learning in the author’s course: aspects related to course organization, content, assessment, and assignments; and their general perceptions of learning through nursing humanities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cassidy, V.R.</td>
<td>For the unit on human experimentation, two literary works were used as case studies in teaching MS (master’s) students about the ethical issues in human experimentation. They were required to discuss the ethical issues associated with the research process by using a study guide with questions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Giarratano, G.P.</td>
<td>Classes (ninety-nine students in the fall class and seventy-four in the spring class) were planned for lecture and discussion on maternity topics based on case studies and short stories. Students were assigned to read the first chapter of the story about women centered care and the tenth chapter dealing with taking care of the first patient. For better discussion, they were instructed to use a worksheet while reading.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Butell, S.S., O’Donovan, P., Taylor, J.D.</td>
<td>Students were required to choose one of the faculty–selected books, research its author, read relevant professional book reviews and develop questions for the student-led book discussion with the help of the librarian.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2) Writing Approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Content of Teaching Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Winland-Brown, J.E.</td>
<td>Thirty-two students taking an acute medical/surgical care course were required to read a novel containing a patient’s experience of being hospitalized with a serious disease, Guillain–Barre syndrome, as one requirement for the course. At the end of the course, they were asked to participate in this study, and each participant was asked to respond in writing to a list of questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Anderson, K.L.</td>
<td>Students were asked to read a target book, which was used as a case study to teach transcultural and other nursing concepts to undergraduate students, and to complete several short writing assignments examining key course concepts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Cagle, C.S., Walker, C.A., Newcomb, P.</td>
<td>Over a period of two semesters, thirty-nine senior nursing students participating in this pilot study were required to complete reading two novels, which focused on minority population groups, and record their responses after reading a journal.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2007  Engstrom, J.L., Hunter, R.G.  In 'The Cider House Rules Project,' conducted by the researchers, students were asked to read the book titled, *The Cider House Rules* (1985) written by John Irving and write a short paper about the novel, answering ten questions about it. This novel focused on sexuality and uninterested pregnancy and other women’s health issues\(^{12}\).

2010  Brown, D.L.  The six junior year nursing students in his clinical group were divided into three groups, each consisting of two students. Each group was required to write a paper that described the essence of their patients using poems\(^{10}\).

### 3) Discussion and Writing Approach

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Content of Teaching Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Newcomb, P., Cagle, C., Walker, C.</td>
<td>Forty young female participants were required to select readings from two novels, which were included in maternal-child clinical courses as part of a pilot project to identify potentially effective strategies for increasing student cultural sensitivity and reflective thinking skills. Then, they were required to read and discuss initial impressions of their readings during five selected one-hour conferences following five hours on a clinical unit. During the week following the conference, students submitted journals that included reflections on the previously discussed readings(^{19}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Halloran, L.</td>
<td>Students were assigned to read one novel from an approved list and then answer the questions posed on a “Cultural Discovery worksheet.” The focus of this assignment was to expose students to a different culture and to expand their knowledge of other cultures. Class discussion was conducted based on a Cultural Discovery worksheet completed by the students after reading a selected novel(^{14}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 4) Other Approaches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Content of Teaching Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>Germain, C.P.</td>
<td>Students were expected to complete a study guide for the required literary work and to prepare one or more questions to address during the class presentation. For a seminar on death and dying, students were allowed to choose their own area of interest. Then an oral presentation that provided insights into nursing the dying and bereaved was delivered by each student based on several selected works addressed in a paper(^{15}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Peterson, L.C., Booth, C.</td>
<td>Short stories were jointly taught through two approaches by one of the authors and an English professor at the college. The two approaches included a literary approach, in which students were encouraged to study stories in terms of theme, point of view, symbolism, literary technique, character description, and plot structure. In the psychological approach, students were requested to examine the authors of and characters within the stories in terms of various mental illnesses(^{18}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Darbyshire, P.</td>
<td>Students were asked to complete two papers in the first term, and write interpretively on the works selected from the first term’s readings and to relate these critically to their personal and professional experiences. This study also devoted some sessions to the discussion of music, paintings, and photographs, visited art galleries, and the writing of poetry(^{17}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Smith, M.A.</td>
<td>Students were given a poem with open-ended questions, and were requested to state two chief complaints and identify all systems for assessment. The poem identifies symptoms in lay terms and focuses on the psychological and physiologic problems as perceived by a patient. Students were then asked to write the key assessment components for two systems based on identified chief complaints. Any additional psychological and physiological patient management concerns had to be addressed for the two chief complaints(^{16}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>McKie, A., Gass, J.P.</td>
<td>Students were requested to read two literary works from the list of four novels as an alternative means of helping students to understand people’s experiences of mental health, and finally the students needed to give a presentation(^{19}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Leffers, J., Martins, D.C.</td>
<td>Students were required to select and read a book from among the twenty-two books provided on the first day of class and grouped to create an aesthetic response for classroom presentation to their peers. All members of the group read the book, then collaboratively developed a response, and creatively shared with the class through Power-Point presentation, mini-research projects, videotaped interviews and so on(^{20}).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Hegge, M.</td>
<td>A graduate course entitled ‘Ethical Issues Influencing Practice and Research in Health Disciplines’ was designed around literature and art. The prologue posed a series of discussion questions about the book and the painting. Students were asked to read the literature, reflect on the painting, and post responses prior to completing the ethics module(^{13}).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The discussion approach was conducted by Williams and George in nursing education in the U.S. as early as 1968. It was mainly practiced from the 1980s through the 1990s, and afterwards seems to have dwindled.

Two primary features for the discussion approach can be found. First, the discussion approach was conducted in relatively small groups. In Williams and George’s study, the number of students participating in the discussion groups varied from six to sixteen according to the literary work selected for discussion. In both Treisman’s study and Darbyshire’s study, the students created a small group consisting of fewer than ten students for discussion. Also, in the study of Cassidy, the students were from the master’s course, indicating a smaller number of students than an undergraduate class. Second, literary works were read with the help of a study guide and a worksheet in both Cassidy’s and Giarratano’s studies. Additionally, a librarian helped the student do a student-centered discussion in Butell, O’Donovan, and Taylor’s study.

The writing approach started in the late 1990s, and was more frequently used than the discussion approach in the 2000s. This approach had three different practices: 1) answering questions in writing, 2) writing comments, and 3) completing a paper. In Winland-Brown’s study, the students were asked to write their answers to the listed questions, while, in Anderson’s study, they were requested to write their own comments or assessments. However, in the late 2000s, some studies required students to write a paper, not a short comment or statement as in both Engstrom and Hunter’s study, and Brown’s study.

The approach integrated with both discussion and writing required students to discuss a selected piece of literature and then write something about it. This approach was widely practiced in the late 2000s. In Newcomb, Cagle and Walker’s study, the students were asked to submit their own journals about the selected works after discussing them. In Halloran’s study, the students were encouraged to answer questions focusing on their exposure to different cultures, and then do a class discussion.

In the late 1980s, other creative teaching approaches were introduced. Other ap-
approaches included mainly three types of approaches: 1) an approach with a presentation such as a PowerPoint presentation, a mini-research project, scrapbooks, and a poster presentation, 2) both a literary and a psychological approach conducted by both an English professor and a nursing educator, and 3) an approach integrated with humanities such as music, fine arts, and film.

The application of approaches based on discussion and/or writing increased, whereas the plain discussion approach was losing its significance in the 2000s.

IV. Discussion

Butell, O’Donovan, and Taylor conducted a thorough search of education, nursing, and other health professional literature by using CINAHL, ERIC, Education Index, Medline, and Ebsco’s Academic Search Elite24. They point out varieties of teaching approaches based on literature which ‘ranged from class discussion, interpretations, to structured study guides with focused questions, to reaction papers and presentations”25. This suggestion is partially in agreement with the above-mentioned analysis of teaching approaches of using literature in nursing education.

Considering the fact that the discussion approach introduced in 1968 was the first method of using literature in nursing education, practicing this approach may have been easier compared to any other approach. Williams and George regarded literature as a helpful material ‘providing an extra stimulus for students who have chosen nursing as a career”26. However, in their study, voluntary groups were formed to discuss literary works and the students got no academic credit27. From this, it can be inferred that the educators faced little difficulty initially in introducing this new approach for teaching students using literature in nursing classes as both the educators and the students were probably not so familiar with this method.

In the discussion approach, creating a small group of students is important for a better discussion. Needless to say, the bigger the class size becomes, the more difficult it becomes for the educator to instruct the student to discuss a target literature in the nursing classroom. Therefore, this may be said to be partially the cause of the discussion approach’s decrease in the 2000s.

Giarratano states, in her paper, that ‘a “worksheet” was made available for students to use while reading, to guide them to recognize and verbalize feelings and to illuminate nursing content the story had to offer’28. Moreover, Butell et al. placed importance on the role of a librarian to conduct a student-centered discussion, and they particularly mentioned that ‘inclusion of the librarian was unique and influenced the shape and rigor of the assignment’29.

In short, to encourage students to conduct a lively and vigorous discussion, supplementary teaching tools such as a study guide and a worksheet, and a contributing instructor such as a librarian can play significant roles in such an approach.

The writing approach, which was initiated in the late 1990s, was conducted in a variety of activities such as responding to the given
questions, completing comments or statements, and writing a paper after a seminar or class. In the 2000s, the student was expected to complete a paper which required higher writing skills. From this fact, it can be said that the nursing educator viewed writing as an important skill for trainee nursing students.

In the 2000s, in both Newcomb's and Halloran's studies, the students were requested to discuss and write something about the given text after reading it. Both activities, discussing after writing and writing after discussing, may prove more beneficial for the student to delve into their own opinions on a selected piece of literature, and share with their peers when compared to discussion or writing.

Overall, the analysis revealed that both the discussion approach and the writing approach were effective teaching approaches to educate nursing students using literature. However, other creative approaches based on writing and/or discussion and those integrated with different forms of arts were also applied in the 2000s. In future, researchers will definitely come up with new varieties of ingenious approaches beneficial to nursing education.

According to the study by Debrew and Rankin, such different types of approaches fulfilling the important criteria for a liberal education will provide the student with an opportunity to improve his/her written and oral communication skills, enhance critical thinking and creativity as well as a knowledge of nursing\(^\text{30}\).

V. Limitation of this study

In this study, a limited number of nursing articles based on literature in nursing education practiced in the U.S. and U.K. were analyzed. Therefore, this study could only provide a rough overview of literature-based teaching approaches in nursing education.

VI. Conclusions

The present analysis regarding nursing education based on the use of literature practiced in both the U.S. and U.K. revealed that literature was first introduced into nursing education in the 1960s, and was used in nursing education in a great variety of ways from 1968 through 2010. This study also can serve as a springboard for further discussion on teaching approaches appropriate for Japanese trainee healthcare professionals to foster their personal and professional growth, as well as enhancement of English language skills in the EFL classroom. This would be beneficial for trainee healthcare professionals to grow as a better professional in future.

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my gratitude to the anonymous reviewers for their valuable comments on this paper.

Note

* Cultural Discovery worksheets were a method to prove that the student had completed the reading and the assignment. The worksheet consisted of 15 questions such as ‘What are your own biases and prejudices
toward other cultures? and ‘How have they changed as a result of the reading and class discussion?’

References


18) Smith, M.A. (1996): The Use of Poetry to
Test Nursing Knowledge, *Nurse Educator*, 21(5): 21
24) Butell, O'Donovan, Taylor, op. cit., 40
25) Ibid., 41
26) Williams, George, op. cit., 229
27) Ibid., 228
28) Giarratano, op. cit., 129
29) Butell, O'Donovan, Taylor, op. cit., 40
30) DeBrew, J.K., Rankin, C., op. cit., 103
31) Halloran, op. cit., 526

Bibliography


Williams, C. and George, J. (1968): Lay Literature As an Adjunctive Teaching Tool, *Journal of Psychosocial Nursing and Mental Health Services*, July-August: 226-229

英米の看護教育における文学作品の実践的活用方法

鶴生川恵美子
群馬県立県民健康科学大学・看護学部・看護学科

目的：英米の看護教育における文学活用に関する研究及び実践報告の分析から、日本における医療系学生対象のEFL（English as a Foreign Language）クラスにおける文学の活用への示唆を得る。

方法：Cumulative Index to Nursing & Allied Health Literature（CINAHL）から収集された英米看護教育における文学活用に関する22件の研究及び実践報告の中で示された文学の活用方法を分類・分析する。

結果：活用方法は1）discussion approach 2）writing approach 3）discussion and writing approach 4）other approaches の4つに分類された。discussion approach は、1968年から始まり、writing approach は1990年代後半から目立つ始めた。絵画、音楽などの芸術との融合、多様な発表形式による活用方法は1980年代から始まり、2000年代にも及んでいる。2000年代に入ってからはdiscussion approach 単独の授業が減少し、discussion とwriting の混合授業及びそれらを含んだ多様な授業活動が主流となった。

結論：英米看護教育における文学の活用方法の概観は、医療系学生対象のEFLクラスにおける文学を基盤とした授業への重要な示唆を示し、今後の実践活用へのステップとなった。

キーワード：看護教育、文学を活用した授業、授業方法、EFL